

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

IN RE: SANTA FE NATURAL TOBACCO  
COMPANY MARKETING & SALES PRACTICES  
AND PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

This Document Relates to All Cases

LEAD CASE NO. MD 16-2695  
JB/LF

**PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY**

In *Benson et al. v. Newell Brands, Inc. and Nuk USA, LLC*, No. 19 C 6836, 2021 WL 532510 (N.D. Ill. Nov. 16, 2021) (Guzman, R.) (“*Benson*”), the court certified a multi-state class of purchasers of a consumer product sold by third-party retailers where Dr. Jean Pierre Dubé proffered the precise damages methodology offered in support of class certification here.

In this case, Dr. Dubé concluded that the determination of class-wide economic damages can be calculated using a Conjoint Analysis. ECF No. 280-008. Using the preference estimates from the Conjoint Analysis, Dr. Dube opines he can implement a marketplace simulation to measure the price premium. *Id.* ¶19. Further, the preference estimates from the Conjoint Analysis can likewise be used to measure willingness-to-pay, the microeconomic measure of total incremental class-wide economic value from the benefits associated with the Challenged Claims on the labels of the Challenged Products. *Id.* ¶20. The *Benson* court found this exact damages methodologies feasible and capable of calculating class-wide damages. *Benson*, 2021 WL 532510, at \*5.

Like in *Benson*, here, Dr. Dubé “begins with the assumption that defendants’ claims about their [products] are false, and states that under that assumption, the economic damages to consumers who purchased the products consist of . . . a Price Premium and Willingness-to-pay (‘WTP’).” *Id.* at \*4, compare ECF No. 280-008 at ¶ 21 (e.g. the proffer of a class-wide damages

methodology starts with “the assumption that the Challenged Claims are false, misleading and/or deceptive.”).

The *Benson* court acknowledged that “price-premium damages calculations based on conjoint analysis designed to isolate the portion of the payment attributable to a misrepresented product feature have been accepted by several courts.” *Benson*, 2021 WL 532510, at \*5. The court confirmed that Dr. Dube does not have to actually perform his Conjoint Analysis at the class certification stage. The methodology presented in *Benson*, which is what is proposed in this case, satisfies the class certification standard as it “show[s] that there is a method of estimating damages that applies class-wide and that method measures damages attributable to plaintiffs’ theory of liability.” *Id.*

Judge Guzman’s consideration of Dr. Dube’s “detail[ed]” conjoint analysis, which was “tied to plaintiffs’ theory of liability,” along with expert criticisms in opposition resulted in a thorough and well-reasoned decision granting class certification.

November 19, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

By /s/ Melissa S. Weiner  
 Melissa S. Weiner  
 PEARSON SIMON WARSHAW, LLP  
 800 LaSalle Ave., Suite 2150  
 Minneapolis, MN 55402  
 Phone: (612) 389-0601  
 Email: mweiner@pswlaw.com

Scott P. Schlesinger  
 Jeffrey L. Haberman  
 Jonathan R. Gdanski  
 SCHLESINGER LAW OFFICES, P.A.  
 1212 SE Third Ave.  
 Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33316  
 Phone: (954) 467-8800  
 Email: scott@schlesingerlaw.com  
 Email: jhaberman@schlesingerlaw.com  
 Email: jgdanski@schlesingerlaw.com

Matthew D. Shultz  
LEVIN, PAPANTONIO, ET AL.  
316 S. Baylen St., Suite 600  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Phone: (850) 435-7140  
Email: [mschultz@levinlaw.com](mailto:mschultz@levinlaw.com)

D. Greg Blankinship  
FINKELSTEIN, BLANKINSHIP, FREI-  
PEARSON & GARBER, LLP  
One North Broadway, Suite 900  
white Plains, NY 10601  
(914) 298-3290  
Email: [gblankinship@fbfglaw.com](mailto:gblankinship@fbfglaw.com)

Caleb Marker  
ZIMMERMAN REED LLP  
2381 Rosecrans Avenue, Suite 328  
Manhattan Beach, CA 90245  
(877) 500-8780 Telephone  
(877) 500-8781 Facsimile  
Email: [caleb.marker@zimmreed.com](mailto:caleb.marker@zimmreed.com)

Michael R. Reese  
REESE LLP  
100 West 93rd Street, 16th Floor  
New York, New York 10025  
Telephone: (212) 643-0500  
Facsimile: (212) 253-4272  
Email: [mreese@reesellp.com](mailto:mreese@reesellp.com)

James W. Gustafson, Jr.  
SEARCY DENNEY SCAROLA BARNHART  
& SHIPLEY, P.A.  
The Towle House  
517 North Calhoun Street  
Tallahassee, FL 32301  
Telephone: (850) 224-7600  
Email: [gustafsonteam@searcylaw.com](mailto:gustafsonteam@searcylaw.com)

Ronald A. Marron  
LAW OFFICES OF RONALD A. MARRON  
651 Arroyo Drive  
San Diego, California 92103  
Telephone: (619) 696-9006  
Facsimile: (619) 564-6665  
Email: ron@consumersadvocates.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs and Proposed Class  
Counsel*